



Date: January 9, 2023

To: Heritage Preservation Commission

From: Emily Bodeker, Assistant City Planner

Subject: Amendment to COA H-20-6, 4630 Drexel Avenue, As-built Elevations, Changes to Rebuilt Chimney

Information / Background:

The subject property, 4630 Drexel Avenue is located on the northwest corner of Drexel Avenue and Country Club Road. The home built in 1924 is a Mediterranean style.

A certificate of appropriateness for the project at 4630 Drexel Avenue was approved September 8, 2020. One of the conditions of the original COA was that asphalt shingles were not an allowable roofing material. At that time, the applicant was agreeable to that condition. The original COA listed Brava Tile, Decra Tile or Clay Tile as options for the approved roofing material.

The property owner requested an amendment to the original COA June 2022 for a change in the approved roofing materials and the rebuilding of the original chimney that needed to come down for safety reasons. The HPC denied the change in roofing materials and approved the reconstruction of the chimney without the addition of an exterior gas fireplace insert. The approved chimney was to be finished in stucco and stone fireplace surround per the schematic to match the original structure.

Staff inspected the site when a final inspection was requested by the permit holder and staff received complaints of the project not being completed and notified the permit holder that the following items were outstanding:

- Fireplace stone detailing
- Garage doors needed painting

The contractor notified staff that the garage doors will be painted when the weather permits.

The property owner and applicant's request is for the HPC to approve a COA amendment to the original COA approving the changes to the rebuilt fireplace and approving the fireplace without stone detailing, as it is currently built today.

Primary Issue:

The Heritage Preservation Commission is asked to review the applicants request-reviewing the chimney as it is built today, without the stone detailing.

The objective of the Country Club Landmark District is preservation of the existing historic house facades and streetscapes. The city has adopted the Secretary of the Interior's standards for rehabilitation when reviewing certificate of appropriateness applications. The secretary of the interior defines *preservation as the act or process of applying measures necessary to sustain the existing form, integrity, and materials of an historic property.*

The secretary of the interior defines *rehabilitation as the act or process of making possible a compatible use for a property through repair, alterations, and additions while preserving those portions or features which convey its historical, cultural, or architectural values.*

Staff believes the following standards of rehabilitation are pertinent to the review of the amendment to COA H-20-6:

- Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a historic property shall be preserved.
- Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
- New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

Preservation Consultant Vogel reviewed the application and has written a memo that is attached in the heritage preservation commission packet. Consultant Vogel notes that in his opinion, the project meets the Secretary of the Interior's standards for rehabilitation. While the exterior chimney is considered an architectural character defining feature of the house, the presence or absence of the outdoor fireplace (stone detailing) does not represent a substantial façade alteration-and this kind of minor change is allowed by the standards of rehabilitation.

Staff Recommendation & Findings:

Staff recommends approval of the amendment to COA H-20-6 approving the chimney as it is built today, without the stone detailing as shown on the COA elevations approved with the rebuilt chimney.

Approval is based on the following findings:

1. The absence of the stonework detailing does not represent a substantial façade alteration and minor changes in detail are allowed by the standards for rehabilitation.
2. The chimney, as built, meets the Secretary of the Interior's standards for rehabilitation.