



Date: January 9, 2023 CONTINUED from December 13, 2022

To: Heritage Preservation Commission

From: Emily Bodeker, Assistant City Planner

Subject: COA H-19-3: 4604 Browndale Avenue As-Built Elevations CONTINUED

Information / Background:

The subject property, 4604 Browndale Avenue, is located on the west side of Browndale Avenue, south of Bridge Street, north of Edgebrook Place and east of Minnehaha Creek. A Certificate of Appropriateness was approved by the HPC May 14, 2019 for a two level addition on the south side of the house, and an addition to the garage area on the front façade and reorienting the garage back to a side loaded garage.

The home, built in 1925, is a two-story Spanish Eclectic style residence. It was built in 1925 for Charles A. Moore, an executive with the United Fruit Company (who is credited with helping to perfect the mechanical process by which bananas are ripened artificially during transport). The house was designed by the architectural firm of Jacob Liebenberg and Seeman Kaplan and is not one of the six “model” Country Club Homes designed for Samuel Thorpe in 1927-1928.

Staff inspected the site and found the as-built elevations do not match the elevations approved with the 2019 Certificate of Appropriateness. At the time of the site visit by staff, there had not been a final inspection that had been signed off and approved. There were outstanding building code items that needed to be addressed with the building department. At that time, staff sent letters to the property owner, COA applicant and permit holder informing them of the discrepancies in the elevation and the need for a final inspection.

To date, a final inspection has been completed with the building department. The building permit has not been closed out due to the changes in the as-built elevations. The applicant’s request is for the HPC to approve a COA amendment approving the changes to the elevations as they are built. The changes in the as built elevation versus the approved COA elevations include:

- Changes in location of decorative tile
- Lack of “planter box” metal detailing on two windows, one on the first floor and one on the second floor.

The objective of the Country Club Landmark District is preservation of the existing historic house facades and streetscapes. The city has adopted the Secretary of the Interior's standards for rehabilitation when reviewing certificate of appropriateness applications.

Preservation Consultant Vogel reviewed the as built elevations and has provided a written memo that is included in the heritage preservation commission packet.

Staff Recommendation & Findings:

Staff recommends approval of the elevations as they are built at 4604 Browndale Avenue as requested by the property owner.

Findings supporting the staff recommendation include:

- The changes to the elevations continue to meet the Secretary of the Interior's standards for rehabilitation and the Country Club Plan of Treatment.
- Tiles and the metal planter boxes are minor ornamental features, and the changes have a minimal effect on the historic integrity of the façade.
- The doorway details are not historic character-defining features, and the façade remains compatible with the neighborhood's architectural character and retains sufficient historic integrity.