



**Date:** January 9, 2023

**To:** Heritage Preservation Commission

**From:** Emily Bodeker, Assistant City Planner

**Subject:** Certificate of Appropriateness: 4909 Bruce Avenue-New Detached Garage

## Information / Background:

The subject property, 4909 Bruce Avenue is located on the east side of Bruce Avenue north of 50<sup>th</sup> Street W and south of Country Club Road. The existing home on the lot is a two story “Mediterranean” style house built in 1927.

The subject property previously submitted a COA request for a new garage that was denied by the HPC. The HPC felt the garage design that was proposed didn’t match the architectural style of the house, specifically the roofline. The applicant redesigned the proposed garage and has submitted a new COA application.

The most recent Certificate of Appropriateness request includes the demolition of the existing detached garage and the construction of a new detached garage.

## Primary Issues:

The request includes the construction of a new detached garage which is why the proposed project requires a Certificate of Appropriateness.

The objective of the Country Club Landmark District is preservation of the existing historic house facades and streetscapes. The city has adopted the Secretary of the Interior’s standards for rehabilitation when reviewing certificate of appropriateness applications.

Staff believes the following standards of rehabilitation are pertinent to the review of the certificate of appropriateness:

- New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historical materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old

and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.

- New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

The garage is comparable to surrounding garage heights and meets the 18-foot, and story and a half maximum height requirement, and setback requirements of the zoning code.

Preservation Consultant Vogel reviewed the application and has written a memo that is attached in the heritage preservation commission packet. Consultant Vogel notes that the existing garage is not historically significant, and no preservation resource will be destroyed with the proposed work. He opines that the proposed garage is compatible with the historic character of the house and surrounding properties and will not have an adverse effect on the integrity of the district.

### **Staff Recommendation & Findings:**

Staff recommends approval of the certificate of appropriateness request for a new detached garage and at 4909 Bruce Avenue as submitted by the applicant.

Findings supporting the recommendation include:

- The information provided supporting the subject Certificate of Appropriateness is consistent with the Country Club District Plan of Treatment.
- The proposed Certificate of Appropriateness meets the Secretary of the Interior's standards for rehabilitation.
- The proposed garage is compatible with the historic character of the house and will not have an adverse effect on the integrity of the district.

Conditions for approval:

- An as built date plaque should be installed on the exterior of the new garage.
- Any change to the approved elevations or materials will need to be submitted for review.